INDIAN INSTITUTE OF SCIENCE E9-252: MATHEMATICAL METHODS AND TECHNIQUES IN SIGNAL PROCESSING HOME WORK #1 - SOLUTIONS, FALL 2014

INSTRUCTOR: SHAYAN G. SRINIVASA TEACHING ASSISTANTS: ANKUR RAINA, CHAITANYA KUMAR MATCHA

Problem 1. The noise-free signal is

 $y\left[n\right] = n^{a}u\left[n-1\right],$

where a is an integer and u[n] is unit step function. Let Y(z) denote the z-transform of the signal. The signal is causal and hence the region of convergence of Y(z) is $|z| \ge 1$.

Case $a \ge 0$:

The z-transform of unit step function is

$$\sum_{n=-\infty}^{\infty} u[n] z^{-n} = \frac{1}{1-z^{-1}} = \frac{z}{z-1}$$

Differentiating w.r.t, z on both sides we have,

$$\sum_{n=-\infty}^{\infty} nu[n] z^{-n-1} = \frac{1}{(z-1)^2},$$
$$\implies \sum_{n=-\infty}^{\infty} nu[n-1] z^{-n} = \frac{z}{(z-1)^2}.$$

Repeating the differentiation a - 1 more times, we get

$$Y(z) = \sum_{n = -\infty}^{\infty} n^{a} u[n] z^{-n} = \frac{f(z)}{(z-1)^{a+1}},$$

for some polynomial f(z).

Therefore z = 1 is $(a + 1)^{\text{th}}$ order pole i.e., 1 is $(a + 1)^{\text{th}}$ order mode for the system. Case $a \le -2$:

We have

$$Y(z) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} n^{a} z^{-n}$$

$$\leq \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} n^{a} |z|^{-n}$$

$$\leq \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} n^{a} \quad (|z| \ge 1)$$

$$\leq \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} n^{-2} \quad (a \le -2)$$

$$= \frac{\pi}{6}.$$

Therefore, $Y(z) < \infty \forall |z| \ge 1$. Hence there are no poles. Case a = -1:

We have

$$Y(z) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n} z^{-n}.$$
$$\implies Y(1) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n} = \infty.$$

Therefore z = 1 is a pole.

Problem 2. 1.4.16 We have

$$\mathbf{x} [t+1] = \mathbf{A} \mathbf{x} [t] + \mathbf{b} f [t] ,$$

$$y [t] = \mathbf{c}^T \mathbf{x} [t] + df [t] .$$

Taking z-Transform, we have

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{X}\left(z\right) &= (z\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{A})^{-1}\mathbf{b}F\left(z\right), \\ Y\left(z\right) &= \mathbf{c}^{T}\mathbf{X}\left(z\right) + dF\left(z\right). \end{aligned}$$

The system transfer function is given by

$$H(z) = \frac{Y(z)}{F(z)} = \mathbf{c}^T (z\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{A})^{-1}\mathbf{b} + d$$

Similarly, for 1.22, we have the system transfer function given by,

$$\overline{H}(z) = \frac{Y(z)}{F(z)} = \overline{\mathbf{c}}^T (z\mathbf{I} - \overline{\mathbf{A}})^{-1}\overline{\mathbf{b}} + \overline{d}.$$

Substituting $\overline{\mathbf{A}} = \mathbf{T}^{-1}\mathbf{A}\mathbf{T}, \ \overline{\mathbf{b}} = \mathbf{T}^{-1}\mathbf{b}, \ \overline{\mathbf{c}} = \mathbf{T}^T\mathbf{c}, \ \overline{d} = d$ in this equation,

$$\overline{H}(z) = \mathbf{c}^{T} \mathbf{T} \left(z \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{T}^{-1} \overline{\mathbf{A}} \mathbf{T} \right)^{-1} \mathbf{T}^{-1} \mathbf{b} + d,$$

$$= \mathbf{c}^{T} \left(\mathbf{T} \left(z \mathbf{I} - \mathbf{T}^{-1} \overline{\mathbf{A}} \mathbf{T} \right) \mathbf{T}^{-1} \right)^{-1} \mathbf{b} + d$$

$$= \overline{\mathbf{c}}^{T} (z \mathbf{I} - \overline{\mathbf{A}})^{-1} \overline{\mathbf{b}} + \overline{d}$$

$$\overline{H}(z) = H(z).$$

Therefore the system transfer functions are same. A and \overline{A} have same eigen values. **1.4.17 (Part 1)** From state-space equations, we have

$$\mathbf{x}[t+1] = \mathbf{A}\mathbf{x}[t] + \mathbf{b}f[t].$$
(1)

To prove,

$$\mathbf{x}[t] = \mathbf{A}^{t}\mathbf{x}[0] + \sum_{k=0}^{t-1} \mathbf{A}^{k}\mathbf{b}f[t-1-k].$$
(2)

Step 1: For t = 1, (2) true from the state-space equation (1). Step 2: Assume true for t = n, i.e.,

$$\mathbf{x}[n] = \mathbf{A}^{n} \mathbf{x}[0] + \sum_{k=0}^{n-1} \mathbf{A}^{k} \mathbf{b} f[n-1-k].$$

We need to prove that the equation (2) is true for t = n + 1.

From state space equations, we have

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{x} \left[n+1 \right] &= \mathbf{A} \mathbf{x} \left[n \right] + \mathbf{b} f \left[n \right] \\ &= \mathbf{A}^{n+1} \mathbf{x} \left[0 \right] + \mathbf{A} \sum_{k=0}^{n-1} \mathbf{A}^k \mathbf{b} f \left[n-1-k \right] + \mathbf{b} f \left[n \right] \quad (\text{use } l = k+1) \\ &= \mathbf{A}^{n+1} \mathbf{x} \left[0 \right] + \sum_{l=1}^{(n+1)-1} \mathbf{A}^l \mathbf{b} f \left[(n+1) - 1 - l \right] + \mathbf{b} f \left[n \right] \\ &= \mathbf{A}^{n+1} \mathbf{x} \left[0 \right] + \sum_{l=0}^{(n+1)-1} \mathbf{A}^l \mathbf{b} f \left[(n+1) - 1 - l \right] . \end{aligned}$$

i.e., the equation (2) is true for t = n + 1. This proves the equation (2) by induction. (b) For time varying case,

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{x} \left[t \right] &= \mathbf{A} \left[t - 1 \right] \mathbf{x} \left[t - 1 \right] + \mathbf{b} \left[t - 1 \right] f \left[t - 1 \right] \\ &= \mathbf{A} \left[t - 1 \right] \mathbf{A} \left[t - 2 \right] \mathbf{x} \left[t - 2 \right] + \mathbf{A} \left[t - 1 \right] \mathbf{b} \left[t - 2 \right] f \left[t - 2 \right] + \mathbf{b} \left[t - 1 \right] f \left[t - 1 \right] \end{aligned} \\ &= \prod_{i=0}^{j} \mathbf{A} \left[t - 1 - i \right] \mathbf{x} \left[t - 1 - j \right] + \sum_{k=0}^{j} \left(\prod_{i=0}^{k} \mathbf{A} \left[t - 1 - i \right] \right) \mathbf{b} \left[t - 1 - k \right] f \left[t - 1 - k \right] \qquad (j = 1) \end{aligned} \\ &\vdots \\ \mathbf{x} \left[t \right] &= \prod_{i=0}^{t-1} \mathbf{A} \left[t - 1 - i \right] \mathbf{x} \left[0 \right] + \sum_{k=0}^{j} \left(\prod_{i=0}^{k} \mathbf{A} \left[t - 1 - i \right] \right) \mathbf{b} \left[t - 1 - k \right] f \left[t - 1 - k \right] . \end{aligned}$$

Problem 3. Note the following relations between ceil and floor functions,

$$c(x) = -f(-x), \qquad (3)$$

$$c(x) - f(x) = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } x \text{ is an integer} \\ 1 & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}$$
(4)

Since X is a continuous random variable,

$$Pr\left[X \text{ is an integer}\right] = 0 \tag{5}$$

Let μ_c and μ_f be the means of c(x) and f(x) respectively. Let σ_c^2 and σ_f^2 be the respective variances. From (3),

$$\mu_{c} = -\mathbb{E}\left[f\left(-X\right)\right]$$

$$= -\int_{-\infty}^{\infty} f\left(-x\right) \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi\sigma^{2}}} \exp\left\{-\frac{x^{2}}{2\sigma^{2}}\right\} dx$$

$$= -\int_{-\infty}^{\infty} f\left(y\right) \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi\sigma^{2}}} \exp\left\{-\frac{y^{2}}{2\sigma^{2}}\right\} dy \quad (\text{using } y = -x)$$

$$\mu_{c} = -\mu_{f} \qquad (6)$$

From (4) and (5),

$$\mu_c - \mu_f = 0 \times \Pr[X \text{ is an integer}] + 1 \times \Pr[X \text{ is not an integer}]$$

$$\mu_c - \mu_f = 1.$$
(7)

From (6) and (7),

$$\mu_c = 0.5,$$

 $\mu_f = -0.5.$

From (4) and (5),

$$\mathbb{E}\left[\left(c\left(X\right)\right)^{2}\right] = \mathbb{E}\left[\left(1+f\left(X\right)\right)^{2}\right]$$
$$= 1+2\mathbb{E}\left[f\left(X\right)\right] + \mathbb{E}\left[\left(f\left(X\right)\right)^{2}\right]$$
$$\mathbb{E}\left[\left(c\left(X\right)\right)^{2}\right] = \mathbb{E}\left[\left(f\left(X\right)\right)^{2}\right].$$

Therefore, the variances are related as

$$\sigma_c^2 = \mathbb{E}\left[\left(c\left(X\right)\right)^2\right] - \mu_c^2$$
$$= \mathbb{E}\left[\left(f\left(X\right)\right)^2\right] - \mu_f^2$$
$$\sigma_c^2 = \sigma_f^2.$$

There is no closed form expression for the variance. The variance can be computed using the p.m.fs of the ceil and floor given by

$$Pr[c(X) = n] = Pr[n - 1 < X \le n], Pr[f(X) = n] = Pr[n \le X < n + 1].$$

Following MATLAB code computes the mean and variances of ceil and floor functions. When $\sigma^2 = 1$, $\sigma_c^2 = \sigma_f^2 \approx 0.5834$.

1 x_range = -100:100; 2 pmf_ceil = 0.5*(erf(x_range) - erf(x_range - 1)); 3 pmf_floor = 0.5*(erf(x_range+1) - erf(x_range)); 4 mean_ceil = x_range*pmf_ceil' 5 mean_floor = x_range*pmf_floor' 6 var_ceil = (x_range.^2)*pmf_ceil' - mean_ceil^2 7 var_floor = (x_range.^2)*pmf_floor' - mean_floor^2

Problem 4. 2.10.52 Sufficient to prove that \mathcal{V}^{\perp} forms a closed group under addition and scalar multiplication. Since, for each $\underline{x} \in \mathcal{V}$, $\underline{x} \in \mathcal{S}$ also holds true, and hence the remaining properties will hold true.

(1) If $\underline{x}, \underline{y} \in \mathcal{V}^{\perp}$, then $\langle \underline{x}, \underline{v} \rangle = \langle \underline{y}, \underline{v} \rangle = 0 \forall \underline{v} \in \mathcal{V}$. $\Longrightarrow \langle \underline{x} + \underline{y}, \underline{v} \rangle = 0 \implies \underline{x} + \underline{y} \in \mathcal{V}^{\perp}$.

(2) $\langle \underline{0}, \underline{v} \rangle = 0 \forall \mathcal{V}$. Therefore $\underline{0} \in \mathcal{V}^{\perp}$. $\underline{0} + \underline{x} = \underline{x} + \underline{x} = \underline{x} \forall \underline{x} \in \mathcal{V}^{\perp}$ is trivially satisfied since $\underline{x} \in \mathcal{S}$.

(3) Let $\underline{x} \in \mathcal{V}^{\perp}$. Since $\underline{x} \in \mathcal{S}$, $\exists \underline{y} \in \mathcal{S}$ such that $\underline{x} + \underline{y} = \underline{0}$. $\implies \langle \underline{y}, \underline{v} \rangle = -\langle \underline{x}, \underline{v} \rangle = 0 \forall \underline{v} \in \mathcal{V}^{\perp}$. Therefore $\underline{y} \in \mathcal{V}^{\perp}$. (4) For $\underline{x}, y, \underline{z} \in \mathcal{V}^{\perp}$, $\underline{x} + (\underline{y} + \underline{z}) = (\underline{x} + \underline{y}) + \underline{z}$ is trivially satisfied since $\underline{x}, y, \underline{z} \in \mathcal{S}$.

(5) If $\underline{x} \in \overline{\mathcal{V}}^{\perp}$ and a is a scalar, then $\langle a\underline{x}, \underline{v} \rangle = a \langle \underline{x}, \underline{v} \rangle = 0 \forall \underline{v} \in \mathcal{V}$. Therefore $a\underline{x} \in \mathcal{V}^{\perp}$

2.12.57 Sufficient to prove that $\mathcal{V} \cap \mathcal{W}$ forms a closed group under addition and scalar multiplication. Since, for each $\underline{x} \in \mathcal{V} \cap \mathcal{W}, \underline{x} \in \mathcal{S}$ also holds true, and hence the remaining properties will hold true.

(1) Let $\underline{x}, y \in \mathcal{V} \cap \mathcal{W}$. Then $\underline{x} + y \in \mathcal{V}$ and $\underline{x} + y \in \mathcal{W}$. Hence, $\underline{x} + y \in \mathcal{V} \cap \mathcal{W}$.

(2) $\underline{0} \in \mathcal{V}$ and $\underline{0} \in \mathcal{W}$ and hence $\underline{0} \in \mathcal{V} \cap \mathcal{W}$.

(3) Let $\underline{x} \in \mathcal{V} \cap \mathcal{W}$. Its additive inverse $\underline{y} \in \mathcal{S}$ is unique. Since \mathcal{V} and \mathcal{W} are subspaces, $\underline{y} \in \mathcal{V}$ and $\underline{y} \in \mathcal{W}$. Therefore $\exists y \in \mathcal{V} \cap \mathcal{W}$ such that $\underline{x} + y = \underline{0}$.

(4) For $\underline{x}, \underline{y}, \underline{z} \in \mathcal{V} \cap \mathcal{W}, \underline{x} + (\underline{y} + \underline{z}) = (\underline{x} + \underline{y}) + \underline{z}$ is trivially satisfied since $\underline{x}, \underline{y}, \underline{z} \in \mathcal{S}$.

(5) Let $\underline{x} \in \mathcal{V} \cap \mathcal{W}$ and a be a scalar. Since $\overline{\mathcal{V}}$ and \mathcal{W} are subspaces, $a\underline{x} \in \mathcal{V}$ and $\underline{a}\underline{x} \in \mathcal{W}$. Therefore $\underline{a}\underline{x} \in \mathcal{V} \cap \mathcal{W}$. **2.12.63** Let \mathcal{B}_v be an orthonormal basis for \mathcal{V} . Let $\mathcal{B} = \{\underline{v} \in \mathcal{B}_v \mid \exists \underline{w} \in \mathcal{W} \text{ such that } \langle \underline{v}, \underline{w} \rangle \neq 0\}$. Hence, we can chose an orthonormal basis \mathcal{B}_w for \mathcal{W} such that $\mathcal{B} \subset \mathcal{B}_w$.

Note that \mathcal{B} forms orthonormal basis for $\mathcal{V} \cap \mathcal{W}$ and $\mathcal{B}_v \cup \mathcal{B}_w$ forms an orthonormal basis for $\mathcal{V} + \mathcal{W}$. Therefore,

$$\dim (\mathcal{V} + \mathcal{W}) = |\mathcal{V} + \mathcal{W}|,$$

= $|\mathcal{V}| + |\mathcal{W}| - |\mathcal{V} \cap \mathcal{W}|,$
$$\dim (\mathcal{V} + \mathcal{W}) = \dim (\mathcal{V}) + \dim (\mathcal{W}) - \dim (\mathcal{V} \cap \mathcal{W}),$$

where $|\mathbf{A}|$ represents the number of elements in the set \mathbf{A} .

We have,

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{V} \oplus \mathcal{W} &= (\mathcal{V} \oplus \{\underline{0}\}) + (\{\underline{0}\} \oplus \mathcal{V}) \,,\\ \dim \left(\mathcal{V} \oplus \{\underline{0}\} \right) &= \dim \left(\mathcal{V} \right) \,,\\ \dim \left(\mathcal{W} \oplus \{\underline{0}\} \right) &= \dim \left(\mathcal{W} \right) \,,\\ \left(\mathcal{V} \oplus \{\underline{0}\} \right) \cap \left(\{\underline{0}\} \oplus \mathcal{V} \right) &= \{\underline{0} \oplus \underline{0}\} \,. \end{split}$$

Therefore,

$$\dim\left(\mathcal{V}\oplus\mathcal{W}\right)=\dim\left(\mathcal{V}\right)+\dim\left(\mathcal{W}\right).$$

Problem 5. (Part 1) Computing the inner products and norms of the signals, we have

$$\langle f_1(t), f_2(t) \rangle = \frac{5}{48}T, \langle f_2(t), f_3(t) \rangle = \frac{5}{48}T, \langle f_1(t), f_3(t) \rangle = 0, \| f_1(t) \|^2 = \| f_2(t) \|^2 = \| f_3(t) \|^2 = \frac{T}{6}.$$

The distance between the vectors \underline{a} and \underline{b} is given by $\|\underline{a} - \underline{b}\| = \sqrt{\|\underline{a}\|^2 + \|\underline{b}\|^2 - 2\langle \underline{a}, \underline{b} \rangle}$. The distance between the signals are

$$\|f_{1}(t) - f_{2}(t)\| = \sqrt{\frac{T}{6} + \frac{T}{6} - \frac{5T}{24}} = \sqrt{\frac{T}{8}},$$

$$\|f_{2}(t) - f_{3}(t)\| = \sqrt{\frac{T}{6} + \frac{T}{6} - \frac{5T}{24}} = \sqrt{\frac{T}{8}},$$

$$\|f_{1}(t) - f_{3}(t)\| = \sqrt{\frac{T}{6} + \frac{T}{6} - 0} = \sqrt{\frac{T}{3}}.$$

The angle between vectors \underline{a} and \underline{b} is given by $\cos^{-1}\left(\frac{\langle \underline{a}, \underline{b} \rangle}{\|\underline{a}\| \|\underline{b}\|}\right)$. Therefore, the angles between the signals are given by

$$\theta_{12} = \cos^{-1}\left(\frac{5}{8}\right),$$

$$\theta_{23} = \cos^{-1}\left(\frac{5}{8}\right),$$

$$\theta_{13} = \frac{\pi}{2}.$$

An orthonormal basis can be derived using Gram-Schmidt ortho-normalization procedure. Since $f_1(t)$ and $f_3(t)$ are orthogonal, normalizing them gives two of the basis. Let $v_1(t)$, $v_2(t)$ and $v_3(t)$ be orthonormal basis of the signal space.

$$\begin{aligned} v_1(t) &= \frac{f_1(t)}{\|f_1(t)\|} = \sqrt{\frac{6}{T}} f_1(t), \\ v_2(t) &= \frac{f_3(t)}{\|f_3(t)\|} = \sqrt{\frac{6}{T}} f_3(t), \\ v_3(t) &= \frac{f_2(t) - \langle f_2(t), v_1(t) \rangle v_1(t) - \langle f_2(t), v_2(t) \rangle v_2(t)}{\|f_2(t) - \langle f_2(t), v_1(t) \rangle v_1(t) - \langle f_2(t), v_2(t) \rangle v_2(t)\|} \\ &= \frac{f_2(t) - \frac{5}{8} f_1(t) - \frac{5}{8} f_3(t)}{\|f_2(t) - \frac{5}{8} f_1(t) - \frac{5}{8} f_3(t)\|} \\ v_3(t) &= \sqrt{\frac{3}{7T}} \left(8f_2(t) - 5f_1(t) - 5f_3(t)\right). \end{aligned}$$

In the signal space with $v_1(t)$, $v_2(t)$ and $v_3(t)$ as the orthonormal basis, the signals $f_1(t)$, $f_2(t)$ and $f_3(t)$ are represented by the following vectors as shown in Figure 1.

$$\begin{split} \underline{f}_1 &= \left(\sqrt{\frac{T}{6}}, 0, 0\right), \\ \underline{f}_2 &= \left(\frac{5}{48}\sqrt{6T}, \frac{5}{48}\sqrt{6T}, \frac{\sqrt{21T}}{24}\right), \\ \underline{f}_3 &= \left(0, \sqrt{\frac{T}{6}}, 0\right). \end{split}$$



FIGURE 1. Signals $f_1(t)$, $f_2(t)$ and $f_3(t)$ are represented in signal space.

(Part 2)Received signal $r(t) = f_i(t) + \delta(t - t_i)$, where $t_i \sim U(Supp(f_i(t)))$. The noise signals are shown in Figure 2.



FIGURE 2. Noise signals corresponding to the input signals $f_1(t)$, $f_2(t)$ and $f_3(t)$ are shown. The noise is an impulse that occurs at a random time instant. This random time instant is uniformly distributed on the support of the corresponding signal.

We have,

$$\langle v_i(t), \delta(t-T) \rangle = v_i(T), \quad i = 1, 2, 3.$$

Therefore, the projection of $\delta(t - t_i)$ onto the vector space defined by the basis $v_1(t), v_2(t)$ and $v_3(t)$ is given by the parameterized curve

$$\{(v_1(t), v_2(t), v_3(t)) \mid t \in Supp(f_i(t))\}, \quad i = 1, 2, 3$$

Hence, when the signal $s_i(t)$ is transmitted, the received signal lies on the parameterized curve given by

$$\mathbf{F}_{i} = \left\{ \underline{f}_{i} + (v_{1}(t), v_{2}(t), v_{3}(t)) \mid t \in Supp\left(f_{i}\left(t\right)\right) \right\}, \quad i = 1, 2, 3.$$

The received signal lies in the region given by $\mathbf{F}_1 \cup \mathbf{F}_2 \cup \mathbf{F}_3$. This is shown in Figure 3. Note that the three curves \mathbf{F}_1 , \mathbf{F}_2 and \mathbf{F}_3 do not intersect.



FIGURE 3. The signals $f_i(t)$ are shown. The regions \mathbf{F}_i corresponding to received signal with noise when a signal $f_i(t)$, i = 1, 2, 3 is transmitted are also shown. The regions are V-shaped parametric curves and do not intersect.

We have the likelihood probability densities

$$p(\underline{r} \mid \underline{s}_i) \quad \begin{cases} \neq 0, & \underline{r} \in \mathbf{F}_i \\ = 0, & \underline{r} \notin \mathbf{F}_i \end{cases}, \quad i = 1, 2, 3.$$

Therefore the aposterior probability densities are

$$p\left(\underline{f}_{i} \mid \underline{r}\right) = p\left(\underline{r} \mid \underline{f}_{i}\right) \frac{Pr\left[\underline{f}_{i}\right]}{p\left(\underline{r}\right)} \quad \begin{cases} \neq 0, & \underline{r} \in \mathbf{F}_{i} \\ = 0, & \underline{r} \notin \mathbf{F}_{i} \end{cases}, \quad i = 1, 2, 3.$$

Note that the regions \mathbf{F}_1 , \mathbf{F}_2 and \mathbf{F}_3 do not intersect. Therefore, if $\underline{r} \in \mathbf{F}_i$, the aposterior probability is maximized for \underline{f}_i .

Therefore the optimal decision as are given by

$$\hat{f}(t) = \begin{cases} f_1(t), & \underline{r} \in \mathbf{R}_1 = \mathbf{F}_2^c \cap \mathbf{F}_3^c \\ f_2(t), & \underline{r} \in \mathbf{R}_1 = \mathbf{F}_2 \\ f_3(t), & \underline{r} \in \mathbf{R}_1 = \mathbf{F}_3. \end{cases}$$

The misclassification error is given by

$$P_{e} = \sum_{i=1,2,3} Pr[f_{i}(t)] Pr\left[\hat{f}(t) \neq f_{i}(t) \mid f_{i}(t)\right]$$

$$= \sum_{i=1,2,3} Pr[f_{i}(t)] Pr[\underline{r} \in \mathbf{R}_{1}^{c} \mid f_{i}(t)]$$

$$= \sum_{i=1,2,3} Pr[f_{i}(t)] \times 0$$

$$P_{e} = 0.$$

Remark: The orthonormal basis can be different depending on the order of signals used during Gram-Schmidt ortho-normalization.